

LIBRARY SERVICES AND THE ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE OF STUDENTS IN PUBLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN SOUTHWEST, NIGERIA

¹Aladetan, Femi Idowu, Ph. D

Email: femi.aladetan@aaua.edu.ng; +2348067196950

Article Info

Keywords: Library services, library resources, education, students' academic performance, public secondary schools

DOI

10.5281/zenodo.16412703

Abstract

This study investigated the relationship between library services and academic performance of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. The research design adopted for this study was a survey-type descriptive research design. The study population was 748,467 senior secondary students from 2,738 public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. The study sample was 2,160 students from 108 public secondary schools selected across Southwest Nigeria. They were selected using the multistage sampling procedure. The research instruments used for data collection were a researcher-designed questionnaire titled 'Library Services Questionnaire (LSQ)' and a proforma tagged 'Student Academic Performance Proforma (SAPP)'. The instruments were validated by specialists in the Department of Educational Management and Department of Tests and Measurement at Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti and Adekunle Ajasin University, Akungba-Akoko. The test-retest method was used to ascertain the reliability of the instrument, and the reliability coefficient obtained for the LSQ was 0.84. This demonstrated that the instrument was reliable, stable, and useful for data collection. The research questions were answered using descriptive statistics such as percentage and mean, while the hypothesis was tested using Pearson's Product Moment Correlation (PPMC) at 0.05 level of significance. Results showed that the state of library services was unfavorable ($x = 2.45$); the level of students' academic performance was high ($x = 3.39$); and there was no significant relationship between library services and students' academic performance ($r = .147$, $p > .05$). The current state of library services does not enhance the academic performance of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. Therefore, it was recommended that schools should ensure that their libraries are well-equipped and that students should be notified whenever new books related to their subjects are acquired. Furthermore, e-library services and photocopy services should be embraced so that students can perform excellently in all learning domains.

¹ Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Adekunle Ajasin University, Akungba-Akoko, Ondo State, Nigeria

Introduction

Education at the secondary level is essential for developing Nigeria. The Federal Government of Nigeria in her National policy on education cited by Adegun (2023) posited that secondary education is the kind of education given to children after primary education and before tertiary education. In other words, education at the primary level is the bedrock, the secondary level is the bridge, and the tertiary level is the terminal. Indeed, a student who completes secondary education is expected to have achieved the objective of contributing significantly to the development of the community whether or not the individual proceeds to a tertiary institution. However, observations have shown that the extent of achievement of education objectives at this level is low.

The academic performance of students at the secondary level of education seems not to be encouraging, especially in Southwest Nigeria. This is evident in the cognitive achievement of students, which is not optimum. A lot of students who completed secondary education in states within the Southwest region did not gain admission into tertiary institutions because they could not meet the minimum requirement of five credits, including English language and mathematics, in the West African Senior Secondary Certificate Examinations (WASSCE) or the National Examinations Council (NECO).

Uduu (2022) and Tyohemba and Abulude (2022) reported that students' performance in WASSCE in public secondary schools dwindled between 2017 and 2018 but experienced an increase in 2019. It increased drastically in 2021 from 51.16% to 73.81% and then to 76.36% in 2022. However, the 76.36% success rate in year 2022 is still not desirable, as it is not the optimum level of achievement in the affective and psychomotor domain seem not commensurate with that of cognitive. Relatedly, certificates are awarded based on character and learning. This underscores the importance of the affective learning domain. Uduu (2022) submitted that the success rate in academic performance needs to be improved.

In recent times, data have shown that while some Southwestern States of Nigeria are not doing so badly, others are worse off. In the analysis of the percentage of candidates that have five credits and above including mathematics and English language in WASSCE between 2014 and 2018 as reported by the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) in Oguguo and Uboh (2020), Lagos, Ekiti, and Ondo States were positioned in 8th, 10th and 12th respectively while Ogun, Oyo, and Osun States were in 18th, 23rd and 24th positions respectively out of the 36 states of the nation and the Federal Capital Territory. This shows that all is not well with students' achievement in the cognitive learning domain.

A library is a location that offers students and teachers access to a variety of information sources and related resources that facilitate learning, teaching, and research (Anom *et al*, 2021). By offering spaces for reading and gathering, libraries have historically symbolically upheld the spirit of education (Campbell, 2006). The library's current function is to provide an atmosphere that fosters peer learning and student participation. According to Ida (2016), since teaching and learning are complex processes, a number of factors to take into account while creating an environment that is both effective and high-quality in order to produce positive results. These include having a well-stocked library and prepared, which seemingly promotes students' academic performance.

The library service is one of the student personnel services required in the elementary, secondary, and university education systems. A school library could facilitate the faster implementation of instructional programs, enabling the achievement of educational goals and objectives. It was observed that nowadays, students are reluctant to visit the library. This is because they have access to information and educational materials on the internet, which can be obtained on their mobile phones. It is noteworthy that some secondary schools do not have electronic libraries that the students seem to find comfortable and enjoyable. The monotonous system of entering libraries to read or borrow books is still in vogue in these schools. Most libraries are stocked with old textbooks, inadequate chairs

for reading, and unqualified and inexperienced library attendants among others. To a large extent, these factors make library services in secondary schools seem ineffective and could negatively impact the academic achievement of students. The provision of adequate man and material resources in the library and the provision of quality services could foster better academic achievement of students in secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria.

Purpose of the Study

This study investigated the relationship between library services and academic performance of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. The objectives of the study were to:

1. determine the state of library services in Southwest public secondary schools in Nigeria; and
2. Investigate the level of students' academic performance in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria.

Research Questions

The following research questions were raised to guide the study:

1. What is the state of library services in Southwest Nigeria's public secondary schools?
2. What is the academic performance level of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria?

Research Hypotheses

The following hypothesis was developed to guide the study:

H₀₁: There is no significant relationship between library services and the academic performance of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria.

Literature Review

In the word of Soltani and Nikou (2020), the development of information literacy abilities, which can be attained through frequent library use, is crucial to students' academic success. The study by Alani *et al* (2014) investigated the connection between academic achievement and library services in Nigerian secondary schools. The researchers discovered that pupils' poor academic achievement was a direct result of inadequate library services. According to Fashola (2014), a library is an educational tool that has the power to dramatically impact students' performance in the end as well as the process of teaching and learning. According to research by Brown and Malenfant (2017) found that students who used the library for their studies outperformed pupils who did not use it in their exam results. The services offered at the library influence students' decision to use it or not. The degree to which students would use the library may be determined by services like registration, the front desk, current and relevant literature, a friendly environment, printing and computer capabilities, the assortment of books on the shelf, and the borrowing system. Additionally, Brown and Malenfant (2017) discovered a strong and positive correlation between students' satisfaction and their academic performance and the facilities, resources, and services provided by libraries. However, Ronald and Frankwell (2014) used both qualitative and quantitative methods to evaluate how Tanzanian secondary school students used the library. They discovered that most schools' libraries do not have pertinent resources, which prevents pupils from using the libraries.

Nevertheless, Kumah (2015) reported a positive, statistically significant correlation between school library services and student academic performance at the University of Ghana. Jato, *et al* (2014) stated that school libraries provide a setting that is helpful for improving mental focus. However, user evaluation must be done in order for a library to satisfy its patrons. Singh and Mahajan (2017) claimed that the evaluation process offers the data required to steer the library in the appropriate path, including developing the collection, launching new services, and enhancing already-existing ones. Users can easily locate items and meet their library needs when the collections are well-maintained and updated.

Librarians and other library employees have a significant responsibility to play in ensuring that students have sufficient access to library resources and information literacy skills. Thus, librarians who are aware of the challenges students face when using the library can be crucial in enabling them to become successful library users and learners. The involvement of the library, librarians, and library assistants is essential to increase students' information literacy and encourage them to use library resources (Soltani & Nikou, 2020). Jato *et al.* in Ida (2016) discovered a positive link between excellent academic achievement among students and school libraries staffed by qualified librarians.

The finding of Ida (2016) on the influence of library services on students' performance are helpful in this study. The researcher found that there were no libraries in some of the secondary schools in Tanzania's Mtwara Mikindani Municipality; students who attended secondary schools with libraries and enough supplies did better on their final exams than those who attended schools without libraries and enough supplies. Further research indicated that teachers and pupils had a low reading culture and that there were not enough new books in the libraries. The situation is not far-fetched from what is obtained in Nigerian secondary schools.

In the same vein, Rodrigues and Mandrekar (2020) reported that libraries are vital because they provide students with useful and trustworthy information, which promotes academic success and improved performance. Researchers discovered a noteworthy and significant correlation between students' academic achievement and success in Goa, India's colleges and library usage. Findings according to Soria, *et al* (2017), using the library at least once during the first year of enrollment greatly increased the likelihood that students would graduate on time rather than dropping out of school. First-year students who used books and electronic resources also had a much higher chance of graduating than those who withdrew. On the other hand, students who participated in a library instruction course and used electronic books had a much higher chance of staying enrolled than dropping out. This infers that using library resources helps keep kids in the educational system longer.

Furthermore, Tubulingane (2021) conducted a study to assess the connection between academic achievement and university libraries. Using a quantitative survey approach, the study discovered that library services have a major impact on students' academic achievement. Additionally, the study found a strong and positive correlation between academic achievement and students' satisfaction with the library service. Researchers have found that quality library service enhances students' performance at all levels of education. For instance, Yusuf, *et al* (2019) examined how secondary school students assessed the impact of library services on their academic performance. 20 schools and their principals were chosen from three senatorial districts in Kwara State using non-probability sampling procedures (stratified, purposive, and convenience sampling). A combination of observational checklists and interviews was employed as research instruments to gather pertinent data for the study. Researchers discovered that library services positively impacted students' academic success. Results also indicated insufficient library resources, staff members, and facilities in schools. Similarly, Vent in Yusuf *et al* (2018) investigated the connection between academic achievement of students in rural Ugandan libraries and library services and discovered that the libraries' services somewhat influenced students' academic performance.

In contrast to the majority of the findings reported earlier, Uzuegbu and Ibiyemi (2013), in their study, found a negative relationship between library services and academic achievement in secondary schools. According to their submission, most secondary schools had outdated and inadequate libraries. Students in Nigerian secondary schools have a negative attitude toward using libraries because of the disarray of the state of library services. Jato *et al* (2014) discovered an inverse correlation between students' academic accomplishment and the services provided by libraries. They deduced that the pupils' bad study habits contributed to their subpar academic performance. The association between a library and students' learning outcomes was established by Adeyemi

(2010) in Ekiti State, Nigeria. According to his findings, the academic outcome of students did not exhibit any significant correlation. When it came to students' accessibility to library resources, Owoeye and Yara (2011) found no discernible differences in their research in rural and urban secondary schools in Ekiti State.

Methodology

The research design adopted for this study was a survey-type descriptive research design. A descriptive research design is useful in describing the existing phenomenon on the state of library services and academic performance of students. The study used a survey research design because the population was large and a representative sample was selected from the population. Here, the researcher was able to carefully record what was observed so that information obtained from a representative sample of the population could be analyzed and the findings from the analysis could be generalized to the entire population. The study population was 748,467 senior secondary students from 2,738 public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. (**Source:** Federal Ministry of Education, Nominal Roll Section, 2023).

The study sample was 2,160 students from 108 public secondary schools across Southwest Nigeria. They were selected using the multistage sampling procedure. In the first stage, three states were randomly selected from the six existing states in Southwest Nigeria. The second stage involved the selection of nine Local Governments from each selected state using a simple random sampling technique. In the third stage, a 12.5% proportionate sampling technique was used to select 108 out of the existing 873 public secondary schools in the three states. In the fourth stage, 20 students were randomly selected from each school to give a total of 2,160 students. The research instruments used for data collection was a researcher-designed questionnaire and a proforma. The questionnaire was titled 'Library Services Questionnaire (LSQ).' The modified 4-point Likert rating scale adopted on the questionnaire was as follows: strongly agree (SA); Agree (A); Disagree (D); and Strongly Disagree (SD) with a rating score of 4, 3, 2 and 1 respectively. 'Student Academic Performance Proforma (SAPP)' was designed and used to collect students' results in the West African Senior School Certificate Examination (WASSCE) for the 2019/2020, 2020/2021, and 2021/2022 academic sessions. This was used to measure the academic performance of students

The instruments were validated by specialists in the Department of Educational Management and Department of Tests and Measurement at Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti and Adekunle Ajasin University, Akungba-Akoko to ensure the face and content validity of the instruments. The test-retest method was used to ascertain the reliability of the instruments. Copies of the questionnaire were administered twice to 20 students who were not participants in the study at Federal Government Technical College, Ikare-Akoko, Ondo State, Nigeria. These questionnaires were administered to the respondents within the space of two weeks. The scores obtained from the two administrations were subjected to Pearson's Product Moment Correlation. The reliability coefficient obtained for the LSQ was 0.84. This demonstrated that the instrument was reliable, stable, and useful for data collection. The statistical tools employed for data analysis included frequency count, percentage, mean, standard deviation, and Pearson's product moment correlation (PPMC). The research questions were answered using descriptive statistics such as percentage and mean, while the hypothesis was tested using Pearson's Product Moment Correlation (PPMC) at 0.05 level of significance. For research question one, mean scores below 2.50 were categorized as unfavorable, while mean scores of 2.50 and above were categorized as favorable. For research question two, mean scores below 2.50 were categorized as low, mean scores between 2.50 and 2.79 were categorized as moderate, and mean scores of 2.80 and above were categorized as high.

Results

Research Question One: What is the state of library services in Southwest Nigeria's public secondary schools?

Table 1: State of Library Services in Public Secondary Schools in Southwest Nigeria

Items	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	\bar{X}
1. Resources are easily located in my school library.	22	20.2	27	25.1	34	31.1	25	23.6	2.42
2. Current and up-to-date books and other library resources	17	15.7	37	34.0	29	27.4	25	22.9	2.43
3. Students are notified whenever new books related to their subjects are acquired.	23	21.2	38	35.5	26	24.4	21	18.9	2.59
4. Library staff assist students in having a seamless library usage	27	25.1	34	31.7	25	23.0	22	20.2	2.62
5. Internet facilities that allow students use e-library are available in my school library.	22	20.7	26	23.6	25	23.3	35	32.4	2.33
6. Rather than going with books, students can make photocopies of the pages of books in the library.	18	16.2	25	23.3	30	27.9	35	32.6	2.23
7. New students are given orientation on the usage of the school library.	31	28.6	27	24.8	28	26.0	22	20.7	2.61
8. Sitting arrangement in the library is comfortable and convenient for students.	30	27.8	27	24.8	21	19.2	30	28.3	2.52
9. The library is spacious enough to accommodate many students at the same time without disturbances.	20	18.3	27	24.8	29	26.8	32	30.1	2.31
Grand Mean									2.45

Result presented in Table 1 indicate that the state of library services in public secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria was unfavorable. This is because the obtained grand mean is below the criterion mean of 2.50.

Research Question Two: What is the academic performance level of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria?

Table 2

Level of Students' Academic Performance in Public Secondary Schools

Academic Session	Number of candidates with 5 credits including English and Mathematics	Number of candidates with 5 credits including either English or Mathematics	Number of candidates with 5 credits without English and Mathematics	Number of candidates with less than 5 credits	
	F	%	F	%	F
					%
					\bar{X}

2019/2020	7840	50.7	6112	39.6	1452	9.4	44	0.3	3.41
2020/2021	8276	51.7	6168	38.5	1440	9.0	120	0.8	3.41
2021/2022	5908	45.7	5736	44.4	1196	9.3	84	0.6	3.35
Average Total	7341	49.4	6005	40.8	1363	9.2	83	0.6	3.39

The analysis presented in Table 2 showed that the level of academic performance of students in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria was high.

Hypothesis 1: There is no significant relationship between library services and students' academic performance. To test the hypothesis, data collected on library services were averaged per school. Data collected on academic performance of students were combined and averaged per school. The two sets of data were subjected to PPMC at a significance level of 0.05. The results are presented in Table 3.

Table 3: Library Services and Students' Achievement

Variables	N	df	\bar{X}	SD	r.cal	p.value	decision
Library Services	108		22.1	9.8			
		214			0.147	0.239	not rejected
Students' Achievement	108		25.3	5.9			

$p > 0.05$

As shown in Table 3, the r.cal value is 0.147, and the p value is 0.239. Since the p-value is greater than 0.05, the tested relationship is not statistically significant. Therefore, the tested null hypothesis that there is no significant relationship between library services and students' achievement was not rejected.

Discussion of the Findings

On library service, respondents agreed that resources are not easily located in the library, books and other resources are not current, internet facilities that allow students utilize e-library are available; students cannot make photocopies of pages of books in the library. However, the respondents agreed that students are notified whenever new books are acquired that relate to their subjects, library staff assist students in having a seamless usage of the library, orientation is given to new students on the usage of the school library, and sitting arrangement in the library is comfortable and convenient for students. This finding corroborates the finding of Ronald and Frankwell (2014) who reported that most schools lack relevant library materials in their libraries, which inhibits students' library usage. Laddunuri (2012) also iterated that libraries are challenged with acute shortages of textbooks and inadequate librarians to meet students' library needs. Ida (2016) reported a low level of reading culture among teachers and students because libraries are not stocked with adequate and current books.

This finding corroborates the findings of Adegboro (2022) and Alabi *et al* (2022), who found that 43.9% of candidates who sat for WASSCE in Federal Government Colleges in South West Nigeria cannot proceed to higher institutions of learning due to poor results and a moderate level of students' academic performance in public secondary schools in Ondo State. The level of academic performance of students was found to be high

Finding indicated that there was no significant relationship between library service and student achievement. This implied that the library services provided in public secondary schools in the study area do not relate to students' achievement. The probable reason for this could be the fact that internet facilities that allow students utilize e-library are not available in many schools sampled and books provided in the library are not up-to-date, This finding, however, disagrees with the findings of Kumah (2015), Ida (2016), Yusuf *et al* (2019), Rodrigues and Mandrekar (2020), and Tubulingane (2021), who reported a positive, statistically significant correlation between school library services, including automated library services, and students' academic performance. In contrast,

Uzuegbu and Ibiyemi (2013), in their study, found a negative relationship between library services and academic achievement in secondary schools. Jato *et al* (2014) also found a negative relationship between library services and students' academic achievement. They concluded that the students' study habits were poor, which led to poor academic achievement. However, the finding of Adeyemi (2010) aligns with the current finding that there was no significant relationship between library and students' academic outcomes.

Conclusion

The state of library services was unfavorable and not desirable in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria was unfavorable and undesirable. This infers that much work must be done on these services to make them desirable and favorable. The level of students' academic performance was high, and the current state of library services does not enhance the academic performance of students in Southwest Nigeria's public secondary schools.

Recommendations

1. Schools should ensure that their libraries are well-equipped, and students should be notified whenever new books related to their subjects are acquired.
2. E-library services and photocopy services should be embraced so that students can excel in all learning domains.
3. Librarians and other library attendants should be properly trained to judiciously perform their responsibilities and assist students whenever they visit the library.

References

- Adegboro, O. B. (2022). *Principals' administrative competence and school effectiveness in federal unity colleges in Southwest, Nigeria* (Unpublished M.Ed. dissertation), Adekunle Ajasin University, Akungba Akoko, Ondo State, Nigeria.
- Adegun, O. A. (2023). *Debacle and conundrum in education: Management for the paradigm shift*. 67th Inaugural Lecture, Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria.
- Adeyemi, T. O. (2010). The school library and students' learning outcomes in secondary schools in Ekiti state, Nigeria. *Asian Journal of Business Management*, 2(1), 1-8.
- Alabi, F. O., Owolewa, O. O., & Wemimo, S. I. (2022). School-community relations and teachers' effectiveness in public secondary schools in Ondo State, Nigeria. *Education and Science Journal of Policy Review and Curriculum Development*, 11(1), 41–51.
- Alani, R. A., Okunola, P. O., & Subair, S. O. (2014). Situation analysis of students' welfare services in Universities in South-Western Nigeria: Implications for students' personnel management practice. *Online Submission*, 7(10), 42- 50.
- Anom, M. Z., Eliy, N. M. N., & Sabiroh, M. S. (2021). The impact of facilities management on students' academic achievement. *Jurnal Intelek*, 16(1), 27 – 39.
- Brown, K., & Malenfant, K. J. (2017). Academic library impact on student learning and success: Findings from assessment in action team projects. In K. E. Brown, D. L. Gilchrist, S. Goek, L. J. Hinchliffe, K. J. Malenfant, C. Ollis & A. Payne (Eds.), *shaping the campus conversation on student learning and*

experience: Activating the results of assessment in action (pp. 105 – 132). Association of College and Research Libraries.

Campbell, J. D. (2006). *Changing a cultural icon: The academic library as a virtual destination*. University of Southern California.

Fashola, K. (2014). Impact of personnel management practices on staff job performance in secondary schools in Southern Nigerian educational system. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 7(3), 269 – 291.

Ida, L. (2016). *Influence of library services on students' academic performance in an ordinary certificate of secondary education examination in Mtwara Mikindani Municipality, Tanzania* (Unpublished M.Ed. dissertation), Open University of Tanzania, Tanzania.

Jato, M., Ogunniyi, S. O., & Olubiyo, P. O. (2014). Study habits, use of school libraries and students' academic performance in selected secondary schools in Ondo West Local Government Area of Ondo State. *International Journal of Library and Information Science* 21(1), 56 – 72.

Kumah, C. H. (2015). A comparative study of use of the library and the internet as sources of information by graduate students in the University of Ghana. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 12(8), 1-19.

Laddunuri, M. M. (2012). *Status of school education in present Tanzania and emerging issues*. McGraw Hill, Inc.

Oguguo, O. U., & Uboh, U. V. (2020). State based analysis of candidates' WASSCE participation and achievement of five credits passes and above including mathematics and English language in Nigeria. *International Journal of Advanced Academic Research (Sciences, Technology and Engineering)* 6(6), 42 – 53.

Owoeye, J. S., & Yara, P. O. (2011). School facilities and academic achievement of secondary school agricultural science in Ekiti State, Nigeria. *Asian Social Science*, 7(7), 60 - 73.

Rodrigues, M. C., & Mandrekar, B. K. (2020). Impact of academic library services on students' success and performance. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*, 1, 1 – 14.

Ronald, B., & Frankwell, D. (2014). *Assessment of access and use of school library information resources by secondary schools students in Morogoro Municipality, Tanzania*. Retrieved from DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska – Lincoln.

Singh, H. A., & Mahajan, P. (2017). University libraries in North India: A comparative analysis. *A Journal of Library and Information Science*, 11(3), 238 – 249.

Soltani, S., & Nikou, S. (2020). An assessment of academic library services: International and domestic students perspectives. *Library Management*, 41(8/9), 631 – 653.

- Soria, K. M., Fransen, J., & Nackerud, S. (2017). *The impact of academic library resources on undergraduates' degree completion*. Retrieved from <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/> CC BY-NC. doi:10.5860/crl.78.6.812.
- Tubulingane, B. S. (2021). University library services and student academic performance. *International Journal of Library and Information Services*, 10(2), 1 – 17.
- Tyohemba, H., & Abulude, S. (2022). *WAEC records 76.36% pass in 2022 WASSCE*. Retrieved from <https://leadership.ng/waec-records-76-36-pass-in-2022-wassce-2/>.
- Uduu, O. (2022). *Public schools record a 73.81% success rate in 2021 WAEC, highest in 6 years*. Retrieved from <https://www.dataphyte.com/latest-reports/education-development/public-schools-record-a-73-81-success-rate-in-2021-waec-highest-in-6-years/>.
- Uzuegbu, C. P., & Ibiyemi, O. T. (2013). Item Community High School library: A reflection of school libraries in Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*, 1, 1 – 15.
- Yusuf, S., Zahyah, H., & Muhajir, T. (2019). Nexus between students' personnel services and academic achievement in secondary schools, Kwara State, Nigeria: The moderating role of supervision. *Amity Journal of Management Research*, 4(1), 1-19.